SUBJECT: Public Art Conservation for City-Owned Artworks and Memorials

BID #: ESC-0252-18 **OPEN DATE: 7/11/18**

COMPETITIVE SEALED PROPOSAL EVALUATION COMMITTEE

KIND AND BASIS OF CONTRACT: Service Contract – One (1) year from date of contract execution with three (3) one (1) year renewal options

AGENCY: Cultural Council

BASIS OF AWARD: Highest Scoring Bidder Based on Evaluation Criteria

NUMBER OF BIDS INVITED: 4 **NUMBER RECEIVED: 4** **OTHER: 0**

SUMMARY OF BIDS AND RECOMMENDED ACTIONS:
Recommend approval to enter into negotiations with the highest scoring bidder, EverGreene Architecture Arts, Inc. The results of the negotiations will be documented and brought before the CSPEC Committee for approval.

1. EverGreene Architecture Arts, Inc. - 100
2. Rosa Lowinger & Associates, Inc. – 88.32
3. Terra Mare Conservation, LLC – 86.43

Attachments: Recommendation Memo, Tabulation and Scoring Sheets and Evaluation Criteria

ANALYST: _____ Annette Burney **RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED** _____ GREGORY PEASE, CHIEF PROCUREMENT DIVISION

CONCURRENCE BY: Christie Holechek, Director of Art in Public Places, Cultural Council of Greater Jacksonville

---

(ALL AWARD ACTIONS SUBJECT TO LAWFULLY APPROPRIATED FUNDS)
ACTION OF CSPEC COMMITTEE ON RECOMMENDATIONS ABOVE

MEMBERS APPROVING _____ MEMBERS DISAPPROVING _____ DATE: _____

_____ _____ OTHER: _____

_____ _____

_____ _____

_____ _____

_____ _____

ACTION OF AWARDING AUTHORITY DATE _____

APPROVED _____ DISAPPROVED _____

OTHER _____

SIGNATURE OF AUTHENTICATION _____

October 18, 2018

MEMORANDUM

TO: Greg Pease, Chief, Procurement
FROM: Christie Holechek, Director of Art in Public Places
RE: Public Art Maintenance for City-owned Artworks and Memorials.

The Cultural Council of Greater Jacksonville received three (3) proposals for the conservation services of 24 city-owned public art and memorials located in public facilities throughout Duval County, and found all to be responsive, interested, qualified and available to provide the services required by the Request for Proposal (RFP). The proposals were scored using the evaluation matrix outlined in the RFP.

Based on the above, the following firms listed alphabetically were determined to be the most qualified of those submitting proposals. The ranking of first, second, and third designates the order of qualifications of these firms to perform the required services:

1. EverGreene Architectural Arts, Inc.
2. Rosa Lowinger & Associates
3. Terra Mare Conservation LLC.

The requested time period of the agreement is for one year with three one-year renewal options based on satisfactory performance and available funding. The Cultural Council requests to begin negotiations with the recommended firm.

If any additional information is required, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Christie Holechek,

Director of Art in Public Places

Leslie-Burney, Annette

From: Mark Rabinowitz <mrabinowitz@evergreene.com>
Sent: Friday, November 02, 2018 3:07 PM
To: Leslie-Burney, Annette
Cc: Kelly Caldwell; Chad Shores
Subject: ESC-0252-18 Public Art Conservation

EXTERNAL EMAIL: This email originated from a non-COJ email address. Do not click any links or open any attachments unless you trust the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Annette Leslie-Burney,

To confirm our discussion of this morning:

We stand behind our proposal to perform the work as specified. As per the specifications, 4.1.b) the proposal covers the needed to "correct any deficiencies of the object, base (if applicable) and plaque (if applicable) identified in the 2016 Condition Survey."

We understood that this was intended to produce a level playing ground for all bidders and we responded accordingly, Conditions had changed since the survey at the time of our inspection and proposal, and are likely to have continued to chance since. but we proposed work only as identified in the Survey following the specification.

As per the same specification item we assume that we would work with the "City to update cost proposals due to unforeseen conditions including but not limited to deterioration over time." Our assumption is that we would provide an updated survey with any cost consequences after award to address these changed condition.However, if no changes in scope are requested we can and will perform the work as per the 2016 survey for the price provided.

We hope that we will be working with your team soon.

Thank you,

Mark Rabinowitz FAIC FAAR '011

Principal Conservator-Vice President

Conservation Solutions, a division of EverGreene Architectural Arts, Inc.

253 36th St, Brooklyn NY 11232

New York I Washington DC I Chicago I Los Angeles | San Francisco

(866) 895 2079 X 703

(301) 943-8249 Mobile

From: Leslie-Burney, Annette <ABurney@coj.net>
Sent: Tuesday, October 30, 2018 1:02:19 PM
To: kelly@conservationsolutionsinc.com
Cc: Freeman, Dustin
Subject: ESC-0252-18 Public Art Conservation

Kelly, there is concern regarding the price submitted by EverGreene Architectural Arts being significantly lower than the other responses. Can you confirm that EverGreene's response and pricing is in accordance to the RFP requirements and that you can meet the project requirements at the price of $199,700.00?

Sincerely,

Annette L. Burney
Purchasing Analyst
Procurement Division
Finance and Administration Department
214 N. Hogan Street, Suite 800
Jacksonville, FL 32202
Ph.: 904-255-8810
Fax: 904-360-8527
Email: aburney@coj.net

CITY OF JACKSONVILLE

*** **Privacy Act:** This communication may contain privileged or other official city information. If you are not the intended recipient or believe that you have received this communication in error, please reply to the sender indicating that fact and delete the copy you received. It is a violation of Federal Law to print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use this information.

TITLE: PUBLIC ART CONSERVATION FOR CITY-OWNED ARTWORK AND MEMORIALS BID NO.: ESC-0252-18 OPEN DATE: July 11, 2018 @ 2 P.M. ANALYST: Annette Burney No. Invited: (4) No. Received (3) No Bids: (0) Recorded By: Renata Barnett Announcer: Sharon Williams		EverGreene Architectural Arts, Inc.	Rosa Lowinger & Associates (RLA) Conservation of Art & Architecture	Terra Mare Conservation, LLC
Notes:				
TOTAL COST:		$ 199,700.00	$ 480,000.00	$ 493,300.00
COMPETENCE	30			
EXPERIENCE	25			
WORK PLAN	25			
FEE	20			
TOTAL POINTS	100			
MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS		Y	Y	Y
Experience 10-15 Years)		✓	✓	✓
References (3 or more)		✓	✓	✓
Examples of Work (3 or more)		✓	✓	✓
Applicable Business License		✓	✓	✓
Qualified Contractor -No Vested Interest		✓	✓	✓
CONFLICT OF INTEREST		Y	Y	Y
INSURANCE AGENT ACKNOWLEDGEMET		Y	Y	Y
ADDENDUM (3)		Y	Y	Y

Public Art Conservation for City-Owned Artwork and Memorials

ESC-0252-18

POINTS	30 Points	25 Points	25 Points	20 Points	OVERALL	Rank
FIRM	**Competence**	**Experience**	**Work Plan**	**Fee**	**Total Points (100 max)**	
EverGreene Architectural Arts, Inc.						
Christie Holechek	30.00	25.00	25.00	20.00	100.00	
Ashley Sedghi-Khoi	30.00	25.00	25.00	20.00	100.00	
Mason Martin	30.00	25.00	25.00	20.00	100.00	
Average	30.00	25.00	25.00	20.00	**100.00**	
RLA Conservation of Arts & Architecture						
Christie Holechek	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.32	88.32	
Ashley Sedghi-Khoi	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.32	88.32	
Mason Martin	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.32	88.32	
Average	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.32	**88.32**	
Terra Mare Conservation, LLC						
Christie Holechek	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.10	88.10	
Ashley Sedghi-Khoi	30.00	25.00	25.00	8.10	88.10	
Mason Martin	25.00	25.00	25.00	8.10	83.10	
Average	28.33	25.00	25.00	8.10	**86.43**	

1.3 **Term of Agreement.**
The term of the service contract will be for one (1) year with three (3) one (1) year renewal options based on satisfactory performance and available funding.

1.4 **Minimum Requirements for Contractors.**
Contractor must satisfy the following mandatory minimum requirements in order to have their Responses evaluated. By submitting, a Contractor warrants and represents that it satisfies these requirements. **Failure to meet these requirements may result in the Response not being evaluated and being rejected as non-responsive:**

a) The Contractor must have no less than ten (10) years' experience in the work detailed in the Scope of Services (Section 4) accompanied by an advanced degree of at least a master's in conservation or a related field, or fifteen (15) years' experience or more if the Contractor does not hold a postgraduate degree. This experience must be demonstrated via a cv/resume identifying similar projects in scope and the ability to perform the scope of work necessary to produce credible assignment results.

b) The Contractor must provide at least three (3) references of clients for which it has provided the services described in the Scope of Services or similar projects.

c) The Contractor must show proof of experience with images and scope of work for at least three (3) examples of past conservation and maintenance work on permanent artworks and memorials in a variety of media such as, but not limited to, granite, bronze, concrete, stainless steel, marble, enamel, copper, wood, aluminum, limestone, painted canvas and muslin, ceramic tile and glass. Conservators who apply as a team must demonstrate both the qualifications of individual team members, as well as the team's qualifications to work together on projects

d) The Contractor must be properly licensed to operate as a company in the state of Florida and hold local Duval County tax certificate if applicable.

e) The qualified Contractor must be an individual or firm with no vested interest in the items being repaired. Any Contractor with such vested interests including but not limited to the purchase, sale, donation, fabrication, or creation of the item or similar items being evaluated is not recommended.

1.5 **Equal Business Opportunity Program.**
It is an official policy of the City of Jacksonville to encourage the maximum participation of Jacksonville Small and Emerging Businesses (JSEBs) in its contract awards based upon availability. To participate as a JSEB on Buyer projects, a company must be certified as a JSEB with the City's Equal Business Opportunity Office.

This RFP and the resulting Contract are subject to requirements of the "Encouragement" Plan, which is fully described on Attachment C to this RFP.

Contractors may contact Buyer's Equal Business Opportunity Office at 904-255-8840 or find the JSEB directory at the City's website at www.jseb.coj.net

1.6 **Documents Available for Inspection (if applicable).**
N/A

1.7 **Federal Funds.**
Federal funds will not be used as part of this solicitation.

SECTION 4

DESCRIPTION OF SERVICES AND DELIVERABLES

4.0 BACKGROUND

The City's Art in Public Places (APP) Program, together with the Cultural Council of Greater Jacksonville, acquires, maintains, and performs responsible stewardship of public art throughout the City. In coordination with the City, the Art in Public Places Program oversees the maintenance, conservation and collections management of over 115 permanent city-owned artworks and memorials located in Duval County. Art in Public Places Program staff will coordinate conservation and maintenance with the City department representative managing the City property where the artworks and memorials are located.

4.1 SCOPE OF WORK

a) The Art in Public Places Program (APP), on behalf of the City of Jacksonville (City), Florida, and Cultural Council of Greater Jacksonville (CCGJ), requires the services of experienced art conservators (Contractor), teams or firms which demonstrate the professional qualifications required to complete conservation treatments of 24 city-owned artworks and memorials.

b) Each object is identified in the 2016 Condition Survey (Exhibit A). They are located in public facilities throughout Duval County, and include a range of sizes of indoor and outdoor sculpture and medium to large-scale integrated design installations. Treatments shall correct any deficiencies of the object, base (if applicable), and plaque (if applicable) identified in the 2016 Condition Survey. The initial scope may be subject to change. The City reserves the right to add or delete projects. The City reserves the right to request updated cost proposals due to unforeseen conditions including but not limited to deterioration over time.

4.2 CONTRACTOR REQUIREMENTS

a) The Contractor must be proficient working with the various media presented in the 2016 Condition Survey including, but not limited to the materials listed in the table below and including the ability to provide lifts, scaffolding, equipment and other subcontractors as necessary.

Acrylic
Aluminum
Bronze
Ceramic (various)
Concrete

Copper	
Glass (various)	
Granite	
LED (Light Emitting Diodes)	
Limestone	
Marble (various)	
Neon light bars	
Polymer fiberglass	
Stainless Steel	
Various pigmented mediums	Acrylic
	Base/ primer (interior and exterior)
	Enamel
	Gilding
	Oil
	Polyurethane
	Powder coating
	Spray paint
	Top coat/sealants
Wood (various)	

b) All incidentals are the responsibility of the Contractor including but not limited to lifts, scaffolding, equipment and other subcontractors as necessary.
c) The qualified Contractor must provide their own transportation and travel accommodations.
d) All work shall be performed in a manner that protects the City's properties and in accordance with conservation and maintenance best practices in handling artworks and memorials.

4.3 CONSERVATION TREATMENT

The 2016 Condition Report (Exhibit A) describes recommended treatments based on the survey of the collection. The Contractor must provide to the Buyer one (1) month prior to commencement of

conservation work, estimated timelines/ or a performance schedule to complete the recommended treatments for each listed object. The Contractor must thereafter complete the treatments in accordance with the schedule and other contract documents. These may be in the form of a report or chart.

4.4 DELIVERABLES

a) Conservation Treatment Time
The estimated time to complete conservation treatments (may be in the form of a report or chart).

b) Conservation Treatment Price Sheet
Complete Form 1 Price Sheet (should include pricing of materials, equipment, and treatment fees).

c) Conservation Treatments correcting any deficiencies of the object as identified in the 2016 Condition Survey.

4.5 FEES

a) A flat fee shall be provided for Contractor's proposal, to include hourly rates for each employee assigned to project. List any outside consultants, if any, and their cost for annual maintenance for each object.

b) Contractor shall also provide an hourly rate for conservation treatment and maintenance consultation. These fees will be used should the City require pre-conservation consultation on additional art work. The consultation fee shall be submitted on Form 1.

(Remainder of page intentionally left blank)

ATTACHMENT B

EVALUATION MATRIX

The evaluations will be based upon the following criteria, and Contractors are requested to provide, as a minimum, the information listed under each criterion. **Failure to provide adequate information on any criterion will result in lower scores and could result in rejection of the proposal as non-responsive.** The response to each of the criterion will be evaluated relative to the other responses received and will be awarded to the highest scoring, responsive, responsible bidder for the total of below Evaluation Criteria. Contractors are encouraged to arrange their responses in a format that will offer ready review and evaluation of each criterion.

1. **COMPETENCY** Describe the background, expertise and experience of firm and subcontractors, demonstrating ability to provide the requested specialized services. Points will be divided per each bullet listed below. **(30 total points)**

   a. Narrative background on Contractor's relevant experience. **(15 points)**

   b. Identification and documentation of experience of key personnel assigned to report with resumes attached. **(15 points)**

2. **EXPERIENCE** Include organization's history and list describing past projects justifying experience in subject matter and tasks as outlined in RFP. **(25 total points)**

   a. List and description of past conservation and maintenance projects justifying experience in subject matter and tasks as outlined in RFP. **(15 points)**

   b. Samples of prior relevant work product with before and after images. **(10 points)**

3. **WORK PLAN** Describe the Contractor's understanding of the requirements of this solicitation, and its ability, approach for executing tasks of RFP. Provide Treatment Schedules for executing Conservation of each project specified in the 2016 Condition Report including Price Sheets (Form 1). **(25 points)**

4. **FEE** The Contractor submitting the lowest total price to the City as determined by Form 1 Price Sheet shall receive the maximum number of points. The Contractor submitting the lowest cost shall receive the maximum number of points for cost **(20 points)**.

   Each sub-sequentially higher price shall be divided into the lowest price received and the product % will be multiplied by the maximum points available to render the points.

   Score = (Lowest Bid/Next Low Bid) 20

(Remainder of page intentionally left blank)

QWS3270X 10/22/2018 10:59 AM
FAML6350 V5.1 ** NW COJ FAMIS PRODUCTION ** 10/22/2018
LINK TO: ACCOUNT SUMMARY INQUIRY 10:58 AM

FISCAL MO/YEAR : 01 2019 CURRENCY CODE :
INDEX CODE : AFPA64N ART IN PUBLIC PLACES TRUST FUND
SUBOBJECT : 04938 MISCELLANEOUS SERVICES & CHARGES
PROJECT :
PROJECT DETAIL :
GRANT :
GRANT DETAIL :
USER CODE :

S	OCT 2018	ANNUAL BALANCE	ALL YEARS BALANCE
ESTIMATED REVENUES	.00	.00	.00
REVENUES	.00	.00	.00
UNREALIZED REVENUES	.00	.00	.00
BUDGET	.00	.00	287,573.00
EXPENDITURES	.00	.00	178,941.48
ENCUMBRANCES	.00	.00	17,764.38
PRE-ENCUMBRANCES	.00	.00	.00
REMAINING BALANCE	.00	.00	90,867.14

F1-HELP F2-SELECT F4-PRIOR F5-NEXT
F9-LINK F10-PRIOR-MO F11-NEXT-MO

G014 - RECORD FOUND