

# **Jacksonville Tree Commission**

**Thursday, September 27, 2018 – 12:00 PM**  
**117 West Duval Street, Third Floor, Conference Room C**

<b>Commissioners:</b>	John Crescimbeni, Chair	<b>Advisors:</b>	Susan Grandin
	Curtis Hart, Vice Chair		Richard Leon
	Chris Flagg		Kathleen McGovern
	Aaron Glick		Joel Provenza
	John Pappas		
	Rhodes Robinson	<b>Staff:</b>	Cindy Chism

## **AGENDA**

*Order of Agenda is Subject to Change*

### **A. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum**

1. Roll Call
2. Submittal of Speaker's Cards
3. Approval of minutes from September 13, 2018 meeting
4. Fund balance and encumbrance report for 15(F), 15(N) and BJP
5. Status of Pending Tree Projects

### **B. New Business**

1. Online Project Evaluation and Tier II Application – CM Crescimbeni
2. Criteria for Tree Pruning/Clearing – Richard Leon
3. Ordinance Code, Planting near Powerlines and Shade Tree – Susan Grandin
4. Legislation for Appropriation of Funds to Public Works for Tree Replacement – CM Crescimbeni
5. Administration Costs – John Pappas, Chris Flagg
6. Outreach for Tree Commission Applications

### **C. Public Comment**

**D. Adjournment – Next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, October 11, 2018.**

Jacksonville Tree Commission  
Meeting Minutes September 27, 2018  
Approved October 11, 2018

<b>Commissioners Present:</b>	John Crescimbeni, Chair Curtis Hart, Vice Chair Chris Flagg Aaron Glick John Pappas Rhodes Robinson	<b>Staff:</b>	Cindy Chism
<b>Advisors:</b>	Jason Teal, OGC Richard Leon, Urban Forest Manager Kathleen McGovern, City Arborist Joel Provenza, Accounting	<b>Public:</b>	Joe Anderson, JEA John November, Public Trust Courtney Wilson, Greenscape Anna Dooley, Greenscape Mike Robinson, Greenscape Dave McDaniel, COJ Public Works

**A.** Meeting was called to Order by Chair at 12:00 PM

1. All present introduced themselves for the record.
2. Submittal of Speaker's Cards
3. Motion made by Mr. Hart, seconded by Mr. Robinson, to approve minutes from September 13, 2018 meeting. None opposed.
4. Fund balance and encumbrance report for 15(F), 15(N) and BJP (Attachment A).
5. Status of Pending Tree Projects (Attachment B) - changes are in green.

**B. New Business**

1. Online Project Evaluation and Tier II Application – CM Crescimbeni
  - a. **The revisions requested from the last meeting will be discussed at the next meeting.**
  - b. The City's Countywide Tree Planting Contract expires on September 30<sup>th</sup>, requiring the Mowing and Landscape Division to put a new contract out for bid. Dave McDaniel (Mowing and Landscape Division) provided CM Crescimbeni with a timeline for that process: Mr. McDaniel will send the bid to Procurement for their review no later than October 3rd; it has already been to Risk Management for review of the insurance requirements. Once Procurement has reviewed the bid, it will be advertised for 30 days. Bids will be turned in and opened the Wednesday after the 30 day period and sent to Mowing & Landscape Division for review and recommendation. A letter will go to the Awards Committee with their selection (once approved) and then go to the Mayor's office for signature. After the Mayor signs, it will go to the Office of General Counsel for contract preparation. This can take three to four weeks. Mr. McDaniel hopes to have a working tree contractor by mid-December.
  - c. Mr. McDaniel said they are continuing to re-work the contract by adding all the items which have been requested by the Tree Commission. The only remaining item is how volunteers will be handled. Mr. Hart asked if working with volunteers was in the existing City Countywide Tree Planting contract. Mr. McDaniel said they would like to add language that clarifies this if the Commissioners agree. Mr. Hart agreed; the point is to get trees in the ground and if the City doesn't have the staff to do it, they want organizations and volunteers to do so. This may require a higher price to accomplish that goal. CM Crescimbeni suggested adding language that says there may be instances in which there is a desire to include volunteers, and list the tasks they may do.

d. Mr. Robinson asked if the Tree Commission could be kept updated on the progress of the Countywide Tree Planting Contract. **CM Crescimbeni suggested it be added as item A.6. of the Agenda until the contract has been signed.**

**2. Criteria for Tree Pruning/Clearing – Richard Leon**

a. Deferred until next Tree Commission meeting; this meeting has not been scheduled. .

**3. Ordinance Code, Planting near Powerlines and Shade Tree – Susan Grandin – Deferred.**

**4. Legislation for Appropriation of Funds to Public Works for Tree Replacement – CM Crescimbeni**

a. The Medjool Date Palm bill came up for consideration in Finance Committee, CM. Gaffney and CM Gulliford both expressed concerns. CM Gulliford requested a two-cycle deferral. He was concerned about not being able to plant these palms at the Beach. The bill should be back on the agenda for the next Finance Committee meeting. It was approved by the Transportation, Energy, and Utilities Committee.

b. Ms. Grandin provided CM Crescimbeni with a final draft of the Tree Program Appropriation. However, there were a few more questions. **CM Crescimbeni will get those questions answered when Ms. Grandin returns.**

**5. Administration Costs – John Pappas, Chris Flagg**

a. Mr. Pappas and Mr. Flagg met with Ms. Dooley and Ms. Grandin on September 20<sup>th</sup>. Minutes are attached (Attachment C). Mr. Pappas provided a list of possible categories which may be considered Administrative/Overhead costs (Attachment D) for the Tree Commission to review.

b. Mr. Pappas noted that tree cost was the first item determined, which includes tree purchase price, delivery, planting, two-year warranty, two-year maintenance and bond.

c. CM Crescimbeni asked the Tree Commission if the City's future Countywide Tree Planting vendor can plant the tree with no overhead costs, should the Tree Commission fund a project with overhead costs? Mr. Pappas added that if the tree is planted in-house, there will be no overhead costs, so doing a comparison isn't applicable.

d. Mr. Pappas pointed out the second bullet on Attachment D which is a list of overhead costs presented for the Commissioner's review. CM Crescimbeni suggested the Tree Commission forge ahead with accepting proposals to be broken down as far as shown on page 2 of Attachment D. Proposals will be submitted with location, tree planning design, quantity, size, type, and a relative number. The Tree Commission then has the responsibility to look at that number and make a subjective decision about whether the use of volunteers is commensurate with any differential in cost that the City's Countywide Tree Planting Contractor can complete the project for.

e. Mr. November said the items the applicant lists on the proposal to earn those overhead costs may justify them. Conversely, if the applicant is not using any volunteers or doing outreach, the overhead should be lower. A case-by-case approach is best.

**6. Outreach for Tree Commission Applications**

a. CM Crescimbeni has spoken with the Neighborhoods Department who provided a schedule of upcoming CPAC meetings. A plan should be developed for an educational/outreach program. Does the Tree Commission believe we should solicit proposals in the absence of a City Tree Contractor? Mr. Robinson agreed that outreach should still be scheduled.

b. **Ms. McGovern will supply Mr. November with information to design a hand-out or brochure.**

**C. Public Comment**

Mr. John November made the suggestion that since there is no City Countywide Tree Planting contractor at this time, perhaps as the applicant is required to get three bids, they could share the bids with the Tree Commission.

The Commissioners could then decide if the bids are reasonable. This is a possible way to get proposals to review despite of the lack of Countywide Tree Planting contract. Regarding outreach, there should be targeted material created for the different types of groups. In addition, leaving the submission date as January 1 may be accurate, considering all the current variables.

**D. Action Items**

**Online Project Evaluation and Tier II Application revisions requested from the last meeting.**

**Tree Pruning - Mr. Leon, Mr. Arpen and Ms. Grandin will draft language to revise the Ordinance Code with consequences for butchering a protected tree, quantify what is and what isn't acceptable, and then if deemed unacceptable, determine if and what the penalty would be.**

**Status of Countywide Tree Planting Contract will be shown as item A.6.**

**Tree Program Appropriation – CM Crescimbeni had questions for Ms. Grandin.**

**Outreach - Ms. McGovern will supply Mr. November with information to design a hand-out or brochure.**

**E. Meeting Adjourned 1:03pm.**

INDEX CODE	Index Code Titles	BUDGET	Actual	Encumbrance	Unencumbered Budget Balance	Reserves	Unencumbered Balance net of Reserves
<b>Subfund 15F Revenue</b>							
PWOD15F5TP	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENSES	29,476,143	41,108,030		11,631,986		11,631,986
JXS15FPW	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENDITURES	7,535,414	8,666,570		1,131,157		1,131,157
JXS15F	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENDITURES	-	8,580		8,580		8,580
TRN15FR31R	TRF TO 15F TREE PROTECTION FR 31F	392	392		-		-
	CONVERSION AND NONCASH REVENUE ENTRIES		338,836		338,836		338,836
	<b>Total Subfund 15F Revenue</b>	<b>37,011,949</b>	<b>50,122,409</b>		<b>13,110,559</b>		<b>13,110,559</b>

\* Subfund 15F Expenditures

PWOD15FFSAS	FOREST STREET ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING	587,850	581,856	5,995			
PWOD15FNMS	NORTH MAIN STREET LANDSCAPING	62,057	40,000	22,057			
PWOD15FBDS	BROWN'S DUMP ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING	364,730	342,361	22,370			
PWOD15FFCAS	5TH & CLEVELAND ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING	494,215	376,792	117,423			
PWOD15FDCS	DUVAL COUNTY SCHOOL BOARD PROPERTY	125,000	32,757	-		92,244	92,244
PWOD15FDTP	DOWNTOWN TREE PLANTING	38,822	26,314	12,508			
PWOD15FZLAE	ZOO LANDSCAPING-ASIAN EXHIBIT	1,824,408	689,345	1,135,063			
PWOD15FIBCL	INTERSEC. BRIDGE MISC 09/10 LANDSCAPING	100,000	78,279	2,435		19,286	19,286
PWOD15FRROW	COUNTY-WIDE TREE PROG-RIGHT OF WAY	4,679,980	4,613,147	36,078		30,756	30,756
PWM15F	TREE MAINTENANCE	1,761,795	1,761,389	(0)	(2,243)		(2,243)
PWOD15FATPP	AVONDALE TREE PLANTING PLAN	31,233	-	31,233			
PWOD15KRSCP	KING ST. PLANTING COLLEGE TO PARK	85,366	-	85,366			
PWOD15FHAMM	HAMMOND BLVD PROJECT	175,761	-	-	175,761		175,761
PWOD15FVPP	COUNTY-WIDE TREE PROG-PRESERVATION PARKS	1,000,000	485,146	-	514,854		514,854
PWOD15FVAP	COUNTY-WIDE TREE PROG-ACTIVE PARKS	1,151,965	619,420	-	532,545		532,545
PWOD15FOSABP	OLD ST. AUG AT BARTRAM PARK	18,364	-	18,364			
PWOD15FLAVC	LENOX AVE. PLANTING VERNA TO CASSAT	26,436	-	26,436			
PWOD15FHR	HARTS ROAD TREE PLANTING	23,718	-	23,718			
PWOD15FTP	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENSES	3,548,513	2,097,444	-	1,451,069	1,449,105	1,964
JXS15FPW	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENDITURES	2,000,635	-	-	2,000,635	2,000,635	-
JXS15F	TREE PROTECTION & RELATED EXPENDITURES	2,365,741	-	-	2,365,741	2,365,741	-
	<b>Subfund 15F Expenditures</b>	<b>20,466,588</b>	<b>11,744,248</b>	<b>1,539,045</b>	<b>7,180,647</b>	<b>5,815,481</b>	<b>1,365,167</b>

\* Includes accounts with encumbrances and budget balances

Unencumbered Budget Balance  
Revenues  
Expenditures  
Unencumbered Balance net of Reserves

Subfund 15F Available to Appropriate (Budget less Actual less Encumbrance less Unencumbered Budget balance)

18,926,040

13,110,559  
7,183,296  
(1,367,815)

2

INDEX CODE	Index Code Titles	BUDGET	Actual	Encumbrance	Unencumbered Budget Balance	Reserves	Unencumbered Balance net of Reserves
PW0015NMTM	Subfund 15N Revenue	242,934	4,394,899	-	4,151,965	-	-
	TREE MITIGATION & RELATED EXPENSES	242,934	4,394,899	-	4,151,965	-	-
	Total Subfund 15N Revenue						
	Total Subfund 15N Revenue	218,642	4,477,974	-	4,196,332		4,196,332
	* Subfund 15N Expenditures						
PW0015NBDTP	BAKERSFIELD DRIVE-TREE PLANTING	8,306	8,306	-	-	-	-
PW0015NHR	HARTS ROAD TREE PLANTING	7,548	-	7,548	-	-	-
JXSF15N	TREE MITIGATION & RELATED EXPENSE	1	-	-	1	1	-
	Subfund 15N Expenditures	15,855	8,306	7,548	1	1	-
	* Includes accounts with encumbrances and budget balances						
	Subfund 15N Available to Appropriate (Budget less Actual less Encumbrance less Unencumbered Budget balance)						4,151,966
PWCP351MIT	Better Jacksonville Plan TREE MITIGATION PROJECT	1,717,826	-	-	1,717,826	-	1,717,826
	Better Jacksonville Plan (for Tree Mitigation) Available to Appropriate (Budget less Actual less Encumbrance less Unencumbered Budget balance)						1,717,826
	Total 15F and 15N Funds						23,078,006
	Better Jacksonville Plan - TREE MITIGATION PROJECT						1,717,826
	Grand Total 9/25/18						24,795,832
	Grand Total 9/25/18						24,835,401
	Difference						(39,569)

2

09/24/18

<u>FY 2018 Revenues by month</u>	<u>October</u>	<u>November</u>	<u>December</u>	<u>January</u>	<u>February</u>	<u>March</u>	<u>April</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>June</u>	<u>July</u>	<u>August</u>	<u>September</u>	<u>TOTAL YTD</u>
34375 TREE MITIGATION FUNDS - ARTICLE 25	29,814	92,473	122,106	20,783	17,931	44,254	67,398	63,240	28,520	15,035	78,707	11,315	591,576
361101 INVESTMENT POOL EARNINGS	-	28,746	8,309	28,967	29,022	16,588	29,738	33,435	19,610	40,772	40,877	-	276,065
36602 CONTRIBUTIONS FROM PRIVATE SOURCES	265,708	277,561	107,546	34,255	461,900	115,320	221,340	184,915	198,555	31,240	52,700	(28,985)	1,922,055
<b>(15F) TREE PROTECTION &amp; RELATED EXPENDITURES</b>	<b>295,522</b>	<b>398,780</b>	<b>237,960</b>	<b>84,005</b>	<b>508,853</b>	<b>176,162</b>	<b>318,476</b>	<b>281,590</b>	<b>246,685</b>	<b>87,047</b>	<b>172,284</b>	<b>(17,670)</b>	<b>2,789,696</b>
34375 TREE MITIGATION FUNDS - ARTICLE 25	112,400	31,245	428,600	40,190	26,115	29,635	158,550	42,000	125,245	15,620	103,331	18,900	1,112,931
361101 INVESTMENT POOL EARNINGS	-	4,498	1,311	4,979	5,137	2,928	5,203	5,982	3,539	7,409	7,695	-	48,680
<b>( 15N) TREE MITIGATION &amp; RELATED EXPENSE</b>	<b>112,400</b>	<b>35,743</b>	<b>429,911</b>	<b>45,169</b>	<b>31,252</b>	<b>32,563</b>	<b>163,753</b>	<b>47,982</b>	<b>128,784</b>	<b>23,029</b>	<b>111,026</b>	<b>18,900</b>	<b>1,161,611</b>
	<b>407,922</b>	<b>434,523</b>	<b>667,871</b>	<b>129,175</b>	<b>540,106</b>	<b>208,725</b>	<b>482,229</b>	<b>329,572</b>	<b>375,468</b>	<b>110,076</b>	<b>283,310</b>	<b>1,230</b>	<b>3,951,307</b>

ω

Browser address bar: <https://jaxtreemitigation.coj.net/> Home - Tree Mitigation Ap...

Navigation: Home Tree Mitigation Tree Commission About Welcome Guest (Visitor) Log in

**TREE MITIGATION**  
CITY OF JACKSONVILLE

**TREE REMOVAL PERMIT INFORMATION**  
Click here to search detailed information on Site Clearing and Tree Removal Permits. In reviewing tree removal information on a specific permit, for "B" permits click on the Spec 2 tab for "L" permits click on the Tree Mitigation tab

**TREE FUND CITY PLANTING PROJECTS**  
Click here to search detailed information about City Tree Fund Planting Projects.

**AVAILABLE FOR APPROPRIATION**

15F (Ordinance)	\$18,926,039.83
15N (Charter)	\$4,151,966.47
Better Jacksonville Plan - Tree Mitigation Project	\$1,717,826.00
<b>Total:</b>	<b>\$24,795,832.30</b>

**FILE AN ISSUE**  
Click here to report site clearing or tree removal without a permit or to request tree maintenance on public property. In the CARE System, select "Tree Remove or Landscape Violation" from the dropdown

*Disclaimer: The AVAILABLE FOR APPROPRIATION information shown on this page is updated nightly from the City's financial records, but does not include any pending appropriations, or other financial transactions of the funds which have not been completed*

If you experience difficulty viewing or accessing the documents provided on this site or navigating this application or table features using any assistive technology please contact the Disabled Services Division at 904-630-4940 or 904-630-4933 (TTY) to request an accommodation.

© 2018 - Official City of Jacksonville and Duval County Government Website. All Rights Reserved. Version: 1.0.0.0

7



9/25/2018

FISCAL_YR	DOC_NO	C_SUF	FUND	VENDOR_NO	IDOR_SU	VENDOR_NAME	Amount	INDEX_CODE	Index Code Title
2018	CTPW07000014	01	15F	591319010	01	JACKSONVILLE ZOOLOGICAL SOCIETY	1135063.14	PWOD15FZLAE	ZOO LANDSCAPING-ASIAN EXHIBIT
2018	PO3019740001	04	15F	340176110	07	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	36077.5	PWOD15FROW	COUNTY-WIDE TREE PROG-RIGHT OF WAY
2018	PO3019740003	02	15F	340176110	07	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	5994.5	PWOD15FFSAS	FORREST STREET ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING
2018	PO3019740004	02	15F	340176110	07	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	22369.5	PWOD15FBDas	BROWN'S DUMP ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING
2018	PO3019740005	02	15F	340176110	07	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	117423	PWOD15FFCAS	5TH & CLEVELAND ASH SITE TREE/PLANTING
2018	PO7A02942006	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	22057	PWOD15FNMS	NORTH MAIN STREET LANDSCAPING
2018	PO7A02942008	02	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	519.5	PWOD15FIBCL	INTERSEC,BRIDGE,MISC 09/10 LANDSCAPING
2018	PO7A02942010	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	538.2	PWOD15FIBCL	INTERSEC,BRIDGE,MISC 09/10 LANDSCAPING
2018	PO7A02942012	03	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	511.32	PWOD15FIBCL	INTERSEC,BRIDGE,MISC 09/10 LANDSCAPING
2018	PO7A02942015	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	865.96	PWOD15FIBCL	INTERSEC,BRIDGE,MISC 09/10 LANDSCAPING
2018	PO7A02942017	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	12508.02	PWOD15FDTP	DOWNTOWN TREE PLANTING
2018	PO7A02942018	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	18364.21	PWOD15FOSABP	OLD ST.AUG AT BARTRAM PARK
2018	PO7A02942019	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	85366.23	PWOD15FKSCP	KING ST. PLANTING COLLEGE TO PARK
2018	PO7A02942021	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	31232.6	PWOD15FATPP	AVONDALE TREE PLANTING PLAN
2018	PO7A02942023	01	15F	340176110	06	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	26435.84	PWOD15FLAVC	LENOX AVE.PLANTING VERNA TO CASSAT
2018	PO7A02942025	01	15N	340176110	11	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	7547.54	PWOD15NHR	HARTS ROAD TREE PLANTING
2018	PO7A02942025	02	15F	340176110	11	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	23718.27	PWOD15FHR	HARTS ROAD TREE PLANTING
2018	PO7A02942026	01	15F	340176110	11	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	32202.87	PWOD15FPRBB	PATTON RD AND BEACH BLVD TREE PLANTING
2018	PO7A02942026	02	15N	340176110	11	THE DAVEY TREE EXPERT COMPANY	62080.49	PWOD15NPRBB	PATTON RD AND BEACH BLVD TREE PLANTING

1,640,875.69

5

## CITY OF JACKSONVILLE TREE PLANTING PROJECTS - ACTIVE

See [jaxtreemaintenance.com.net](http://jaxtreemaintenance.com.net) - Tree Fund City Projects for links to legislation and planting details

CD	Project Title	Project Scope	Project or Ordinance Number	Division/Project Manager	Estimated Cost	Actual Cost	Anticipated Start Date	Actual Start Date	Anticipated Completion Date	Actual Completion Date	Status
7	Main Street	Tree removal and planting on N. Main St. between 1st St. and 7th St.	2017-0111-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Richard Leon/Fred Pope	\$22,057.00	\$20,176.85	8/20/2018	8/20/2018	9/17/2018		Complete/inspect
7	Harts Rd & Dunn Ave. Medians and Streetscape in Downtown Jacksonville	5 Date Palms to be planted on two medians on Harts Rd. at the cross street of Dunn Ave. (Phase 1) 8 Date Palms to be planted as replacements in Downtown Jax (4 on Riverside Ave., 2 on Adam St. W, 1 on Forsyth St W, 1 on Monroe St) (Phase 2) 13 Date Palms total. Includes removal of existing Date Palm stumps in city street planting boxes. Introduced by CM Gaffney. Appropriation from Tree Fund 15F.	2018-0007-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Richard Leon/Kathleen McGovern	\$62,540.03	\$62,540.03	Phase 1 4/10/2018 Phase 2 4/25/18	Phase 1 3/23/2018 Phase 2 4/30/18	Phase 1 6/11/18 Phase 2 6/11/18	6/11/2018	Project and inspection Complete 6/11/18
6	Old St. Augustine Rd Medians	Two median tree plantings on Old St. Augustine Rd. from Bartram Park Blvd to entrance of Palmetto Leaves Park South. (No removals) Introduced by CM Schellenberg. Appropriation from Tree Fund 15F.	2018-0043-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Richard Leon/Kathleen McGovern	\$18,364.21	\$18,364.21	4/20/2018	6/1/2018		8/8/2018	Punchlist 8/24/18
14	King Street	King St. from College St to Park St., replacement planting on nine medians and sidewalk cut-outs. Introduced by CM Love. Appropriation requested from 15F.	2018-0159-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Richard Leon/Kathleen McGovern	\$85,366.23		5/11/2018	5/11/2018	8/20/2018		Complete/inspect
4	Patton Rd/Beach Blvd. -Southside	Right of Way Plantings on two adjacent sites at the intersection of Patton Rd. and Beach Blvd. (no removals) and residential right of way plantings. Introduced by CM Scott Wilson and through citizen request. Appropriation requested from 15F (\$32,202.87) and 15N (\$62,080.49)	2018-0190-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Dave McDaniel/Kathleen McGovern	\$94,283.36						Scheduling
14	Avondale Neighborhood - Tree Planting Plan	Tree Planting in City ROW on residential streets in Avondale replace dead/storm damaged trees. Introduced by CM Love. Appropriation requested from 15F.	2018-0273-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Richard Leon/Kathleen McGovern	\$31,232.60		7/19/2018	7/19/2018	8/20/2018		In Progress
4	Lenox Ave. Tree Planting	Tree Planting in City ROW tree planting (no removals) on Lenox Ave. from Shen Ave to Cassat Ave. Introduced by CM Dennis, Appropriation requested from 15F	2018-0307-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Dave McDaniel/Kathleen McGovern	\$26,435.84		10/12/2018				Scheduling
7	Harts Rd. II Medians and Right of Way	Tree Planting in City ROW and medians. Introduced by CM Gaffney	2018-0369-E	Public Works - Mowing and Landscape Dave McDaniel/Kathleen McGovern	\$31,265.81		9/12/2018	9/12/2018			In Progress/Phase 1 Complete/Phase 2 Underway

Attendees: John Pappas, Commission Member                      Chris Flagg, Commission Member  
                  Anna Doolley, Greenscape                                      Susan Grandin, OGC

Staff:                      Cindy Chism

This is a subcommittee to discuss potential administrative costs associated with Tree Mitigation trust fund projects. The goal of this meeting is to have a list of recommendations for what is applicable with any maximums which need to be applied.

Mr. Pappas passed out some of his suggestions for what administrative costs may be (Attachment 1).

Ms. Doolley passed out some information from the Arbor Day Foundation (Attachment 2) and then a sample of what another not-for-profit may include in their grant request (Attachment 3).

Mr. Pappas suggested the committee look first at Attachment 1 and determine if the categories listed were appropriate.

- 1) Planning – Does the subcommittee believe the administrative costs or expenses should be applicable to the applicant to coordinate the actual plan? Should there be a planning component to administrative costs.
  - a) Ms. Doolley replied that yes, there has to be. Typically Greenscape meets with Home Owner's Associations, Community Groups or Property Owners, anyone who may be involved with the project must "buy-in." Mr. Pappas responded, since the Application would come after that, would those costs be recouped. Mr. Flagg agreed that is typical of a Design firm; by having the fee contain some planning dollars, that makes it a serious project; there are serious dollars and time being spent so it needs to be treated in a professional manner. Mr. Pappas continued we want a great final product and we want buy-in from whoever is associated with it which why the planning side seems important.
  - b) Ms. Grandin added the point of this process is to get the trees in the ground. Public Works doesn't have the staff to come up with designs, or manage the projects, so we want non-profit groups to do it. Mr. Pappas agreed and added that the Tree Fund is providing the salary for one position, the Arborist whose role is to facilitate these projects and to support their development. However, this planning portion may be before it gets to our employee. Our staffer is going to be trying to do our own projects and be unaware an HOA is interested in doing a project. Ms. Grandin agreed the planning is very important, i.e., we don't want a group to try to plan a project and they have no idea what type of trees and where they should go. Mr. Pappas added for that type of scenario, we hope they call the Arborist for guidance. Ms. Grandin wondered if perhaps a Landscape Architect shouldn't be required.

Ms. Grandin reminded the committee there is no Grant contract attached to the Application. This would let the Applicant know what the City expects from an award recipient and then they would contract with their own people. Perhaps one should be added?

Ms. Doolley agreed and added that there should be some validity to who the advisors are; do they have a degree, and what type of experience or credentials do they have which show they can do this type of work.

Ms. Doolley pointed out on Attachment 3 though the numbers are arbitrary for the discussion; they are from one of the non-profits contacted.

- 1) The first heading, Design, Site Location and Species Location, that dollar figure is a magical percentage of the next figure, Tree Delivery and Base Cost. This number is going to be determined by how many hours are put in for design, sight location, etc. How does that then equate to compensation and benefits as an employee. It could be higher or lower depending on the complexity of the project.
- 2) Then there is Project Management and Funding Procurement as well as Volunteer Coordination. The subtotal is then the cost per tree. However if a warranty is required then those numbers are added by year.
- 3) Mr. Flagg pointed out the cost per tree on Attachment 3 is \$66.70, which is approximately a 50% markup at \$136, looking at typical nursery costs, this is very low. Ms. Doolley added her group buys wholesale. Mr. Flagg agreed that is a fair price however then maintenance needs to be added and that brings it to \$225 per tree. Ms. Doolley continued that the prices will change with size and species.
- 4) Mr. Pappas pointed out using the numbers from Attachment 3, the cost is a 237% markup or 3.37 multiplier per tree.

Ms. Doolley continued Attachment 2 is what another non-profit uses in their budget. All of these items are the way a professional contractor prices things, a blanket price.

Mr. Pappas reminded the subcommittee that if the trees were purchased using the City's Countywide Tree Planting contract the prices include all of the categories with the exception of design and planning. If they don't use the City's contract, the prices of the trees they do get cannot be any more expensive than the City's contract price.

Mr. Pappas suggest the subcommittee decide what is applicable, based on the attachments Ms. Doolley provided, everything that the project costs. The 15% which was discussed at the Tree Commission is not going to work. Do we believe the planning component should be included? It is before the Application is submitted. Ms. Doolley believes the planning should be included. Mr. Pappas asked if magnitude of the project should influence the percentage. Ms. Doolley replied yes, if the project is larger, it will take more to manage and coordinate.

Mr. Flagg added the categories listed on Attachment 1 are solid. Out of the categories, if each one is a percentage of 100 what's the 100, where do we make that determination? In my experience planning is 15-30% of a project, design is 30-90%, the remainder is the contract documents etc., then you hit 100% and the tree is being planted. Will the administrative cost number be a flex number or an umbrella number? Mr. Pappas agreed and added a suggested maximum with the caveat that every project will stand on its own.

Mr. Pappas pointed out that on Attachment 3, The City's Countywide Tree Planting Contractor would include the Warranty, both Year 1 and Year 2 Maintenance in the Tree and Delivery Base Cost, so the Subtotal would then be \$155.27. This is a \$70 administrative fee per tree to get to the \$225; 45% of the cost of the tree. Mr. Flagg agreed this was more reasonable, perhaps a range, 50% baseline and 70% on complex projects. Ms. Grandin confirmed that maintenance would be included in the cost of material (tree).

Ms. Grandin added that the Application should break down all of these categories, as in Attachment 3. Mr. Flagg continued perhaps, a 20-60% range; 20% for simple jobs and 60% for more complex jobs, and as a Commission we assess that level of complexity when the Applicant is before the Commission.

Subcommittee questions for the Tree Commission:

- Should a grant contract be added to the Application?
- Should credentials or qualifications be required for Project Planning and/or Design?

Meeting adjourned at 3:35pm

## **Tree Commission Committee Tree Mitigation Trust Fund – Administrative Costs Considerations**

Purpose: To determine if and what Tree Planting Project Applicant Expenses seem appropriate and are eligible for Tree Mitigation Fund use.

Tree Fund Projects...develop a List of Project Overhead Categories that should be considered for Fund compensation:

- Planning
  - Applicant – Coordinate with adjacent Property Owners (HOA), Community Group or other Private Entity (like a Florida Blue)
  - Applicant – Develop application and coordinate thru Tree Commission process
- Design
  - Applicant – Manage Designer
  - Designer (Consultant)
    - Survey
    - Geotechnical...to determine soil type
    - Plans, Specifications & Bid Documents
- Installation/Construction
  - Applicant – Contractor/Vendor oversight
    - Consultant support, if required
  - Applicant – Volunteer organizer and oversight
  - Warranty Cost
  - Bonds

For Applicant Expenses, consider what components of the expenses are eligible:

- Direct Labor Costs (manhours)
  - Management of Organization
  - Direct Management of Project
- In-Direct Costs (Overhead)
  - Office
  - Supplies
  - Vehicle use

amdoolley, search your mailbox

Home Attachment 2)

- Compose
- Inbox (2)
- Drafts
- Sent
- Archive
- Spam (52)
- Trash (11)
- Smart Views
- Important
- Unread
- Starred
- People
- Social
- Shopping
- Travel
- Finance
- Folders
- Drafts
- 00
- Outbox
- > Recent

Budget Info

Mary Sweeney <msweeney@arborday.org>  
 To: amdooley@bellsouth.net

Sep 18 at 4:54 PM

I've attached a copy of our current RFP that's open for employee engagement projects. You can see the budget categories in here that we ask about. I would say that you shouldn't feel crazy asking for \$175-225/tree for a 15-gallon tree. That would include 2-3 years maintenance in that price. That's about average of what people ask throughout the country. In places like NY, it's closer to \$1000/tree. In other places it is less because they have their own nursery. One nonprofit we work with uses a base price of \$225/tree in everything they do with us. Now, you'd have to add in extra to your budget to cover things like your overhead (okay to include about 20% for this item), food and beverage (usually we estimate about \$10/person for lunches), tools and supplies, etc. Hopefully that gives you some guidance. Let me know if you have any other questions. Thanks!

Mary

Mary Sweeney

Project Development Manager  
 Work: 402-473 2034 | Cell: 402-202-0193

**Arbor Day Foundation**  
*"We inspire people to plant, nurture, and celebrate trees"*

211 N. 12th St.  
 Lincoln, NE 68508



Invest for  
 the long haul  
 at E-TRADE

Turn Your Photos Into  
 Canvas Prints



SurveyMo.pdf

Reply Reply to All Forward More



**Project Proposal**

**\* 3. Project Details**

Site Name	
Approximate Address/Intersection	
City	
State	
Zip	
Number of trees to be planted	
Number of other planting materials (shrubs, perennials, etc.)	

**\* 4. Project Budget Information (Please provide only monetary values)**

Tree Costs	
Supplies (mulch, ties, stakes, etc.)	
Tools	
Overhead	
Maintenance (2 years)	
Refreshments	
Other	
<b>Total Budget</b>	
<b>Cost/Tree</b>	

NOTE: Calculate your Cost/Tree by adding Tree Costs + Supplies + Overhead + Maintenance, then dividing that total by the # of Trees to Plant.

5. (Optional) If you are providing refreshments or have other budgetary expenses listed above, please clearly describe these below so the corporate partner knows exactly what you will be covering.

--

SAMPLE TREE PRICING DETAIL 15 Gallon Tree Volunteer Planting

Design	Tree and	Project Mgmt	Volunteer	<u>Sub Total</u>
Site Location	Delivery	Funding Procurement	Installation	
<u>Species Selection</u>	<u>Base Cost</u>	<u>Volunteer Coord</u>		
\$17.75	\$66.70	\$52.00	--0--	\$136.45

(7%)	Year 1	Year 2	<u>SubTotal</u>
Warranty	Maintenance	Maintenance	
	Water/Mulch	Water/Mulch	
\$4.57	\$56.00	\$28.00	\$88.57

Total Cost Per Tree \$225.02



## Tree Commission Committee Tree Mitigation Trust Fund – Administrative Costs Considerations

Purpose: To determine if and what Tree Planting Project Applicant Expenses seem appropriate and are eligible for Tree Mitigation Fund use.

Tree Fund Project Administrative/Overhead Categories that should be considered for Tree Fund compensation (to be based on a percentage of the actual "Tree Cost"):

- Proposed that the "Tree Cost" include the following (as they are/will-be included with the City's County-wide Tree Planting Contract):
  - Actual Tree purchase price
    - Tree Delivery
    - Tree Planting
  - 2 Year Warranty
  - 2 Year Maintenance (watering)
  - Bond
- Administrative/Overhead Costs consideration components (from Greenscape example, it appears this may be a 40% to 60% value of the "Tree Cost"):
  - Planning
    - Applicant – Coordinate with adjacent Property Owners (HOA), Community Group or other Private Entity (like a Florida Blue)
    - Applicant – Develop application and coordinate thru Tree Commission process
  - Design
    - Applicant – Manage Designer
    - Designer (Consultant)
      - Survey
        - Geotechnical...to determine soil type
        - Plans, Specifications & Bid Documents
  - Installation/Construction
    - Applicant – Contractor/Vendor oversight
      - Consultant support, if required
    - Applicant – Volunteer organizer and oversight

For Applicant Expenses, consider what components of the expenses are eligible:

- Direct Labor Costs (manhours)
  - Management of Organization
  - Direct Management of Project
- In-Direct Costs (Overhead)
  - Office
  - Supplies
  - Vehicle use

SAMPLE TREE PRICING DETAIL 15 Gallon Tree Volunteer Planting

Design	Tree and	Project Mgmt	Volunteer	<u>Sub Total</u>
Site Location	Delivery	Funding Procurement	Installation	
<u>Species Selection</u>	<u>Base Cost</u>	<u>Volunteer Coord</u>		
\$17.75	\$66.70	\$52.00	---0---	\$136.45

(7%)	Year 1	Year 2	<u>SubTotal</u>
Warranty	Maintenance	Maintenance	
	<u>Water/Mulch</u>	<u>Water/Mulch</u>	
\$4.57	\$56.00	\$28.00	\$88.57

Total Cost Per Tree \$225.02

2